

---

ICANN78 | AGM – GAC Capacity Dev Workshop (5 of 10)  
Saturday, October 21, 2023 – 4:30 to 5:30 HAM

GULTEN TEPE:

Hello, and welcome to the ICANN78 GAC breakout session, part two, being held on Saturday, 21st of October at 14:30 UTC. Please note that this session is being recorded and is governed by the ICANN Expected Standards of Behavior. During this session, questions or comments submitted in the chat will only be allowed if put in the proper form as noted in the chat. Interpretation for this session will include six UN language and Portuguese.

Please click on the interpretation icon in Zoom and select the language you'll listen to during this session. If you wish to speak, please raise your hand in the Zoom room, and once the session facilitator calls upon your name, kindly unmute your microphone and take the floor. Before speaking, ensure you have selected the language you'll speak from the interpretation menu.

Please state your name for the record and the language you'll speak if speaking a language other than English. To ensure transparency of participation in ICANN's multi stakeholder model, we ask that you sign into Zoom sessions using your full name. With that, I'll hand the floor over to Tracy Shaw. Tracy.

TRACY HACKSHAW:

Thank you Gulden, and welcome back as we have our talk show format. Yes, let's do this. But unfortunately, we're going to start with

---

***Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.***

---

people who are not on stage. We're going to start with the guys who are online. So you have a few more minutes to prepare those people on stage while we begin with the reporting out online. So how are we going to do this?

We are going to have each rapporteur, reporter, however you want to do it, report out from the breakout sessions, and then we're going to have some interactivity, which is why you are here. Not just reporting, we're going to have some discussions either amongst yourselves, with us, and with me if necessary if no one else wants to have any questions. Remember we are trying to get the regional perspectives far as possible.

So keep that in mind if that wasn't teased out in the sessions, see if you can find a way to tease it out. But of course, try your best to report as to what you spoke about. And ideally, since we all have interpretation, you can speak in your native language as far as possible if you wish, up to you, what you feel comfortable with. All right. Yeah, feel free to get your headsets in the meantime. Yeah, no problem for those who are waiting while we get that. So while we get that set up, Pua, maybe you could take the mic and introduce who will be doing the reporting out from the Zoom room from the [00:04:17 - inaudible] reporting. They'll go first.

PUA HUNTER:

Thank you, Tracy. We have our repertoire online. Dr. Shamsuzzoha, over to you.

---

Dr. SHAMSUZZOHA:                   Should we start, Pua?

TRACY HACKSHAW:                   Yes, you can go ahead.

DR. SHAMSUZZOHA:                   Thank you. We had a good discussion in the online forum and we have mostly discussed most of the questions and we have few responses from different countries. So it was like a combined in one group, so it was difficult to group the answer in regions, rather, we discussed and presented the answer in terms of the countries. The first one is about that context of GAC, how the government representatives and the reason or country in that sense in our group, collaborate in internet DNS matters.

As I see the responses from Bangladesh, the response that it was outside GAC who does the most effective engagement in terms of the IDN issues when we get allocated with the IDN ccTLD. So there was an issue about the script development, the AGL development in the IDN program. So it was the first real interaction power administration with ICANN and read from further that we developed our engagement with GAC as well.

In addition to that, in DNS or internet issues, we normally also participate and communicate to the regional forums including APNIC to have technical suggestions and other steps. In addition to that, we also participate in the other regional forums, including IGF and APRICOT sessions to see the industry dynamics. For Cook Island, I

---

think it's common for most of the development countries as well, that there's a weak interaction in terms of internet and DNS matters in the country. But and at a regional level for the global stakeholder investment team, they have a strong collaboration for DNS admin issues. And for Japan, Japan recently hosted the IGF, so they have a very good collaboration as reason and internal data that they mentioned.

For question two, how is ICANN viewed by government, region or country, and what can be done? We enhanced the collaboration further. So from Bangladesh, I think that the response from Cook Island is the same. So far, it's not very dominant in terms of the importance of engagement with ICANN, except the IDN and their issues, if I'm talking from the Bangladesh viewpoint, the response that we get.

But we think that considering the new GLT and the IDN implementation, these are two of the important aspects where from ICANN, more engagement can be done with the developing countries and how to add more values to those countries. So these are the avenues, which can be [00:07:39 - inaudible] to add more value of ICANN activities to the developing country.

And the responses of Cook Island, we see that it's not really very vividly visible, but more engagement is required at regional and country level both from policy and technical perspective through different meetings and events. And in terms of the ICANN78 key discussion topics in GAC, the most of the important issues we discussed are the cyber security, including the DNS abuse and also

---

how the administration can get the data based from the registries that is on the review in ICANN policy development process, that's very important that how the public interest can be offered there and how the ICANN Board response [00:08:40 - inaudible].

And also from Japan, we have a very good response that yes, they also agree that DNS abuse is a very key topic and also [00:08:52 - inaudible] privacy is one of the key points of discussion ICANN, and we need to find a common ground of solution for this many selections.

And for the reason of [00:09:07 - inaudible], what should be the concern to the government and what should be discussed in the GAC? The same issues that we [00:09:16 - inaudible] DNS abuse and cybersecurity, and also in our online forum, we discussed that we had more value of ICANN activities in the developing countries. We should utilize these two programs, implementation of the IDN and the possibilities of new gTLD list for the developing countries.

So these are the key topics that should be an interest of the developing countries, and we can add more value to different reasons, especially to the developing countries, and especially for the Cook Island and Bangladesh that we mentioned here.

And to improve the regional participation of GSE members, how we can improve it. So we get the responses from Cook Island and Bangladesh, but I think there's a general argument [00:10:10 - inaudible] in addition, not limiting to the ICANN meetings, formal meetings, we should have more informal interaction, and the regional and country level through capacity development workshop and

---

through bilateral meetings. So it was the discussion [00:10:30 - inaudible]. Thank you.

TRACY HACKSHAW: Thank you very much, Bangladesh, I think that was a good report out. I just wanted to ask a question. How many countries did you have, either maybe Pua can answer or Bangladesh in the breakout in Zoom? How many countries were there?

DR. SHAMSUZZOHA: I think it was around 15 to 20 countries, but we received responses [00:11:04 - inaudible] from three or four countries.

TRACY HACKSHAW: All right, thank you very much. So let's give the Zoom room, remote, a round of applause. Getting, yes. All right, now before we get to the others--

DR. SHAMSUZZOHA: Thank you.

TRACY HACKSHAW: No problem. Before we get to the other reporters or rapporteur as the case may be, any questions for Bangladesh? For the Zoom participants, any questions on what they spoke about? We heard a lot of issue, DNS abuse being key topic, IDNs, anything that you wanted to

---

ask them? Let's make this as interactive as possible. So these are the key priorities of the folks from these countries.

Are they similar to what you see in your country? Are they going to be things that you think you should look at as a government? Any thoughts, any ideas, any responses? All right. Seems like we're in violent agreement with what's going on, so no disagreement. All right, well, if you have any questions, feel free to ask them. Ah, somebody's brave enough to ask a question. Thank you, sir.

MD EHSANUL KABIR:

I'm Ehsanul from Bangladesh. Actually, I'm attending physically and Dr. Shamsuzzoha, he's my deputy, he attended virtually. So whatever [00:12:26 - inaudible] said is our standpoint, and I like to reiterate that the regional engagement should be increased for the GAC participants through workshops, bilateral meetings, et cetera. Thank you.

TRACY HACKSHAW:

All right. It's important point, regional engagement to be increased. So I think we have our colleagues from ICANN Org in the room, Laura and others listening very closely to what's happening here. So this is important feedback. Anything else? All right. I'm going to start with my furthest away from me. Yeah. So Thiago, Columbia. Feel free to speak in whatever you wish, Spanish or English up to you.

THIAGO DAL TOE:

Just a question before, are we going to talk about the different questions one by one and go everybody, or...?

---

TRACY HACKSHAW: Well, we have an hour, so.

THIAGO DAL TOE: I think we should do like the one question and then everybody will answer it. That way, we're going to be changing in between voices, if that's okay with everybody.

TRACY HACKSHAW: Is that okay with everyone? Okay. Let's do it. So question one. Tiago, do you want to read the question?

THIAGO DAL TOE: Do you want me to read the question?

TRACY HACKSHAW: All right. And I am the host, aren't I? Question one, "Outside the context of the GAC, how do government representatives in your region collaborate and interact on internet/DNS matters?" And they're on screen for those who don't understand my accent.

THIAGO DAL TOE: Okay. So I'll be intervening in Spanish. First, I'd like to thank the members. We had Spain, Columbia, Brazil, we also had international organizations or regulators, Telcat, Argentina, and we also had Rose who spoke in Spanish. Thank you for that. So we talk about two



---

issues. When we talk about the internet and the DNS, we distinguish between internet governance because there's a lot of communication in relation between countries who take part in a number of spaces.

But when we talk about the DNS in itself, there isn't much cooperation. There's a lack of knowledge here at a general level. Something that was mentioned was that in many cases, NIC in each of the country is different and there's often not sufficient knowledge about this. It's a very technical issue and it's not easy to understand this. So there seems to be a lack of cooperation, and that is something that we think should be worked on from GAC to the regions, especially with the Latin American Caribbean region.

But there does seem to be a difference between internet governance and DNS, these seem to be separate issue. And the DNS should be at the same level when it comes to cooperation as compared to internet governance. Thank you.

ALISA HEAVER:

So we'll go back to English now. My name is Alisa Heaver, I'm from the Dutch government. And so we were with about 10, 15 people from across the whole world. So we took a lot of time to look at which forum were used to discuss DNS or internet related issues. For the Asia Pacific region, there is a Asia Pacific Forum. The African Union also has their own regional debating space as the Asian community.

And in Europe, we have the high-level group on internet governance, that's presided by the European commission. And what I explained to the others in that group is that there's an open section where all multi-

---

stakeholder participants can cooperate and listen in, and there's a closed section for member states only.

So that's how we also try to immediately incorporate the multi stakeholder model in that discussion. So that could be something that other regions could use as well. And also, well, the Caribbean region is also very active. Would you like to maybe tell a bit more about the Asia Pacific region and the internet governance forum?

UNKNOWN SPEAKER:

Sure. So not to double up on English speakers in this panel, but I'm providing-- we're splitting duties on this piece because we had a fair bit of divergence in the regional spread. But I think the only additional point I'd like to include is we had an-- the Internet Governance Forum is also a good venue to explore some of these issues. We had an Asia Pacific Regional Internet Governance Forum on in Brisbane about six to eight weeks ago. And as part of that, we had a parliamentarians track.

We tried to bring government and government decision makers together to talk about internet governance issues. And as part of that, we talked about the role of ICANN and the GAC to try and close the gap on some more internet governance, traditional internet governance matters, and some of the bigger digital governance issues that also come up at IGF as well. So it was a bit of an experiment for us, but it was an important regional piece that flowed into the broader global IGF that was on in Kyoto just last week. Anything else you wanted to add on that piece? Thank you.

TOMBOYE IBRAHIM:

Hello, everyone. I will be speaking in French. I am Tomboye Ibrahim from Chad. As far as our group, it was a French speaking group, we had Africa, Chad, Mali, Gabon, as well as the European Union. And we also had Germany. As far as the topics internet and the DNS, outside of the GAC, at the local or regional level, we have forums such as IGF, whether it is at the local or regional level, we have the School of Governance where we talk about the topic of the internet and the DNS. But those are initiatives that are not organized by governments, but rather by civil society, ISOC, for example.

What we also have is a meeting of the French speaking world. It used to exist before, and we do talk about these topics of ICANN and so forth. But after covid, those meetings have not started up again. We are working on that so that we can go back to meeting with the French speaking world and talk about ICANN related topics. That's all I have to say.

MANAL ISMAIL:

I'm going to report on the Arabic speaking group. And we had seven participants, and please, correct me if I missed anyone. We had Lebanon, Iraq, Libya, United Arab Emirates, Mauritania, League of Arab States, and Egypt. And on the first question, so outside the context of the GAC, we have the League of Arab States where the governments of Arab countries normally meet. And we have a working group on internet issues. And this is the main venue where governments discuss DNS issues and other internet related issues.

---

But also during the discussion, we also brought up the venues like the Arab IGF, the IT working groups, and here, where the topic gets broader with regards to internet governance and internet at large. And also, diverse stakeholder groups when it comes to the Arab IGF and so on. I think that's about it, and I stand to be complimented by my colleagues if I missed anything.

WANG LANG:

Thank you, Manal. Good afternoon. I'm Wang Lang from GAC China. I represent the Chinese group mostly in the Asia Pacific region. We discussed the two collaborations in Asia Pacific region where one is between the government and the government. Others is between the government and the industry. And we discussed three kind of corporation in our region. The first one is DNS security mechanism such as we introduce M route instance from Japan wide project.

And we deploy reservation service loads across our region to make the resolution surveys more stable and more efficiently. And the second one is we do our cooperation based on our original organizations and platforms such as APR, IGF, APTLD, APNIC, et cetera. And we develop the IDN, that is Internet Domain Name, especially Chinese domain name, to localize the domain industry. Okay. That's it.

CLIFFORD BOSTIC:

Thank you very much. My name is Clifford Bostic. I'm from the Caribbean, from the small country of Barbados. In our group, we had represented Australia, Barbados, of course. In the African region, Uganda, Rwanda, Nigeria. In Europe, Germany, parts of the United

---

States, Trinidad and Tobago. Outside of the context of GAC and ICANN, our governments collaborate on internet and domain name service matters in forums such as in Internet Governance Forum, IGF, ARIN, APNIC out of the Pacific, AFRINIC out of Africa, LATNIC from the Americas and the Caribbean region, from Europe, RIPE and EuroDIG, as well as RIRs.

The focus of most of our meetings is on internet governance and the processes across the particular regions. And we also deal with cyber security, which is one of the major concerns that all of us have on the internet services.

What we find is that there is a lot of diversity when it comes to the discussions across these regions focusing on internet. There's also some of the interactive ideas and things that come up that we need to resolve such as fair share and those kinds of issues. We try to make sure that governments are transparent in our dealings simply because we manage not only internet governance, but also access to providers who are licensed operators as well as over the top services, and of course, big tech. Thank you.

TRACY HACKSHAW:

Thank you very much. Well, wow, that was a lot of content coming out of those groups. I heard the word IGF mentioned a lot. Seems like the IGF is the major space where many of the regions or the countries in those regions get together as well. Let's hear a little bit more about that, I'm sure as we go forward to question two. Before I do that though, any impact on you so far? Any feedback you wish to have, or

---

you wish to add on question one? No, this is interactive, so let's keep it going. We don't have to get through all five quickly.

Let's get the juices flowing, interaction going. Any questions? This is all just good for you, right? Yes? All right. I'll ask you some questions shortly, don't worry. Question two, "How is ICANN viewed by governments in your region, and what can be done to enhance the perception of ICANN in developing countries?" So let's reverse it and start with our colleague from Barbados.

CLIFFORD BOSTIC:

Thank you very much. We know across the region that ICANN is very important to us in terms of managing the internet space and the domain name services. We know that before that process we have for domain names, the internet would not exist, and we thank ICANN for that tremendously. If you had asked me that question though about two years ago, I probably would've said to you, I know one of our gentlemen in the ministry deals with ICANN and if the parliament had to decide on whether or not they would agree with someone of team visiting, ICANN come into one of these forums, they may have had some difficulty.

How ICANN is viewed is it's a body that's important, very important to the internet, but we don't understand the function they serve, we couldn't tell you in detail what's happening. So we need to address first of all, the barriers to entry. And the entry is not about, sorry, it's about participating in ICANN. The information that comes out from ICANN or the processes is very detailed and very opaque, if we could be firm and fair, it is opaque.

---

The information that we see is very difficult to interpret by the normal person who is outside of the proceedings of ICANN. If you're not attending ICANN meetings or if you don't understand how ICANN functions, then it's very difficult at the higher level, at the government higher level to determine whether or not we should participate. What that means is that the process is not simple. It's not simple for the layman in government.

So, how can it be changed? We need to see some more simplicity coming out of ICANN so that the average person out there in government in particular can understand what's happening with the events that taking place. And I speak specifically for the Caribbean region where it is fairly difficult for us. Since we don't have a lot of resources to assign to ICANN, what happens is that the person who comes out to the ICANN meetings or participate is the same person who has access of our support and responsibility for, let's say, our data center, which is multifaceted as you would know.

Across the various regions and the Asia Pacific regions, the region is diverse and developing, and therefore, like the Caribbean, we do not have a lot of resources. And so we need to break down some of these barriers to entry, barriers to understanding. So we need to see more awareness going out, not only from ICANN, but from our IGF.

And we want to see ICANN as part of our internet governance forum so that more discussion can take place and that our persons who are involved in the internet space, that they can help ICANN and ourselves to understand the ICANN processes and so on. And this is in particular also across other regions like for example, Africa where the

---

discussions normally center around coverage and affordability and cloud services, and the issues with regards to infrastructure.

But again, if you had to ask someone to explain how ICANN functions and how we can participate, they would have some difficulty. So it's awareness that we need coming out from ICANN and through IGF, the Internet Governances Forums. But when it comes beyond awareness, we also need to focus on how ICANN functions, how can we participate more? How can we understand exactly what's happening with every step of the process within ICANN? Thank you.

WANG LANG:

In our group, most of the governments regard ICANN as one of the most important international organizations in internet, especially in the internet infrastructure. And ICANN play a leading role in promoting the development of science and technology and to bridge the digital divide. In terms of enhancing the perception in developing countries, we discussed three points. The first one is we should encourage them to attend our HLG M to make them aware the importance of ICANN.

The second one is ICANN may provide more financial support such as travel support to the developing countries. And the third, ICANN may develop more training or capacity building in the developing country. ICANN can do it by itself, ICANN can do it with other platforms such as the Belt and Road initiatives to help the developing country build their infrastructure. Okay.



---

MANAL ISMAIL:

And within the Arabic language speaking group, we discussed two approaches for this. First, ICANN reaching out to governments in developing countries and from the region. And I understand that there is already efforts in that respect. And they are discussing within the leadership that the GAC chair may participate in events that are taking place within relevant organizations in the region to make sure we get active participation from the region, but also to invite governments who are not yet members of the GAC to join.

And second is the high-level governmental meeting as well and the opportunity it provides for governments to be made aware of the ICANN and GAC efforts and work and hoping that this would also hire the importance of the file on the agenda of the governments from the region.

TOMBOYE IBRAHIM:

As far as the French speaking group, as I was mentioning, we had the European Union as well as Africa represented. As far as the European Union, they are very involved in the ICANN, the work of ICANN before the meetings, they prepare their position on the topics being discussed at ICANN. As far as the Africa region, or at least as far as the countries that were in our group, ICANN is not very well known at the level of the governments, or perhaps there's just a lack of attention given to ICANN.

The topics that are debated at the level of ICANN don't necessarily affect them. So what we thought is perhaps moving to a different approach to choose topics that are of interest for our governments. As

---

far as the high-level GAC meeting, that is a great opportunity to talk about those topics, the topics of interest at a high level.

We would also propose that there be more high-level meetings so that more governments might be involved. Now, of course, as representatives of countries within the GAC, we do participate, but in order to affect the high level, it's a little bit harder because we would really need to discuss topics that are of great interest to our different countries.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER:

I'm seeing a lot of consistency. So the second English speaking group had the Caribbean Southeast Asia Europe, Africa, and the Pacific. And there were quite a number of common threads across all of our different regions. And I'm picking up on a lot of similar threads here across a couple of the other language groups.

I'm happy to break down some of the regional variances, but I think in general we had a lot of consistency in the lack of understanding of what ICANN does, or even a lack of understanding of ICANN as a brand or an organization in general. There were comments here about lack of understanding of internet governance, but there is a distinct interest in internet and digital related issues.

So I think there's a bit of a tension there about how do we capture attention of countries who are interested in digital issues and draw that connection back to ICANN's role in their broader landscape with regard to what can be done to enhance the perception of ICANN developing countries. There was a lot of discussion about increasing

---

engagement as well as drawing attention to the tangible benefits achieved by engaging in ICANN or some of the capacity building projects that ICAN may have on the go. Have I missed anything?

ALISA HEAVER:

No, so I have two practical-- well, we've missed one thing because in the previous round, I forgot to say that we also had someone from Suriname who doesn't fall under one of these categories, sorry, Caribbean. And for her internet society, was a really important organization and the chapter. And the other thing is time-wise, we've only covered two questions, so we should think about speeding up. So that's my cue to hand over the mic.

THIAGO DAL TOE:

I'll be speaking in Spanish. So in our group, we did not mention David's participation also from the Vatican, who also intervened. But with regard to that very specific issue, I fully agree with my previous colleagues. As DNS is a highly technical topic, there is this lack of understanding, and in some cases, even lack of interest from governments. At times, governments have a greater knowledge of this issue.

And here we have all been witnesses of the fact, for example, .amazon, .patagonia, we've seen that governments showed a strong interest in this issue. But outside these very specific issues, it is not so common. In some countries, as mine, Colombia, there is a resolution that provides which entity represents Colombia before the GAC, in this case the Ministry of Technology and Communications. But that is not the

---

case in other countries where countries are represented, for example, by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

On the other hand, now thinking about enhancing ICANN's perception in countries, it could be through specific events or certain specific thematic dialogues. For example, talking about DNS SEC and the importance of its implementation, and bringing this other topic to the table, governments might get interested. Then topics such as DNS abuse or cybersecurity might lead governments to develop an interest in ICANN.

TRACY HACKSHAW:

Thank you very much. And I think just to [00:41:43 - inaudible] point, trust the process, trust the process, because we need to hear the voices of people we haven't heard before, and I think that's important. So let's ensure we give everybody the voice that they have. And this voice, I heard a particular point I wanted to tackle. In the French group, it says the topics that are debated at this level of ICANN don't necessarily affect them when speaking about governments. Does that resonate with anybody in this room?

The topics that are discussed at ICANN don't necessarily affect governments. Any response to that at all? That is, do you feel the same way? No. But that's a feeling that's coming through in some ways, right? And to be asked earlier, so you're saying no now, but when we ask the question in the morning about where ICANN issues were the priority list, I think I saw five hands go up of the whole room, not a priority list.

---

THIAGO DAL TOE: Tracy, I was going to say different, not that it's not a priority. Sometimes in some countries, they see, for example, and I mentioned in the group when we talked about connectivity, right? Countries who propose and say, I want to connect, reduce the digital divide, but they don't see it as the DNS system. They see connectivity as antennas and cell phones and all that, not the DNS, and that goes within. For them, that's already in the system, right?

They take it for granted, let's say, unless that is a problem, and that's what we said in our group, right? What happens when things are not working out, for example, or in cybersecurity, when there is an issue through DNS abuse and a country shuts down, like what happened to Costa Rica? What do you do? How do you fix what happened? So I think that's what, in our group at least we talked about.

TRACY HACKSHAW: So it's not a priority necessarily in terms of ICANN, but the underlying issue might be on the priority list.

THIAGO DAL TOE: And maybe not named, it's not named as such, but it's within another issue of connectivity, for example.

---

TRACY HACKSHAW: Exactly. And I think we heard as well that people don't know who ICANN is, so they can't pick the link. We heard that is coming through as well.

CLIFFORD BOSTIC: I think you just said it absolutely correctly. The problem here is if I was a doctor and was speaking to you about ailments or diseases, and I was using the language that doctors understand, I would lose probably 100% of you. And you may say that what I just spoke about has no relevance to you. So, let me translate this back to ICANN.

When we send in cabinet papers for attendance to ICANN programs, a number, and right now in the Caribbean, there are about 30 of them, 30 cabinet ministers review the requests, and they will ask for qualification, they will ask for more information. It is because they do not understand the language that's coming from ICANN, but what they're speaking about when they translate back to English what DNS means, and that before DNS, the internet would not work.

If the DNS system fails, ever fails, internet stops working, we know that. So any discussion about DNS services matters to governments, but it is the information, the way it comes down to the level of a minister who has to put up his or her hand and say, yes, I'm in agreement with this request, and I tick in the box and it is approved.

And so you see someone come out from the particular government in the Caribbean, then you know that we understand clearly the importance of ICANN, clearly the importance of DNS and what DNS is representing. I think what gets lost is the translation. So what I'm

---

saying to you today and tomorrow and the day after, is that ICANN's processes need to be simplified so that the guy in the street, the citizen understand this is important to us.

So, if ever you see from any of these countries, Asian Pacific, it's a diverse region, Africa is also diverse, Latin America and the Caribbean is very diverse, and these are a lot of small and developing states that don't have a lot of resources and people, when ICANN send something out to us, it must be understood clearly by all of us, not just the techies. And not all the techies understand it either. I think what's happening here is that we are losing from the respondents, whether the topics are important or not, simply because the language that comes down from ICANN is not reaching everyone. And I think that's key, we must not miss that.

TRACY HACKSHAW: So it's ICANN speaking a different language to everything else.

CLIFFORD BOSTIC: Yes.

TRACY HACKSHAW: Not French, not English, not Arabic.

CLIFFORD BOSTIC: It's not simple to understand.

---

TRACY HACKSHAW: It's ICANN.

CLIFFORD BOSTIC: The language as well as the procedures and what you're discussing is not easy for all of us to understand. Please don't miss that one.

TRACY HACKSHAW: I hope the folks in GE are hearing this. Okay. Manal, you wanted to respond and say something?

MANAL ISMAIL: Yes. Actually, I was going to say that maybe the topics here, we are not able to link them properly to the agenda of the governments. For example, when we say new gTLDs, it doesn't really ring a bell with the governments, but once it gets to geographic indicators, sensitive strings, religious terms, then everyone gets alerted, and it becomes a little bit late in the process. So maybe just trying to make more links or breaking down the vague terminology or the big processes into things that could resonate with the governments and link to their priorities. And for the sake of time, maybe I also go through question three.

TRACY HACKSHAW: I'm going to do it slightly differently.

MANAL ISMAIL: Okay.



---

TRACY HACKSHAW: So questions three and four, very similar, very similar. So I'm going to ask all of you now to pick one key topic that you think came out from your discussion. I know it may be hard, but think about it. One key topic that came out of that discussion for ICANN78, and generally that should be of concern to the region or your country or whatever level went on. So Manal, since you have the mic, maybe you can start with that one-- is there one key topic that you think came out of your-

MANAL ISMAIL: Can I say key keywords?

TRACY HACKSHAW: Sure. Go ahead.

MANAL ISMAIL: I don't want to miss any of the topics that we discuss, so.

TRACY HACKSHAW: Sure.

MANAL ISMAIL: Just in tweets, Universal Acceptance was one, the new gTLDs in general with the early warnings and so on, and the Applicant Support Program in specific. And a really interesting point was raised

---

regarding rules and regulations that sometimes could impact the transfer of the support financials to certain countries.

And we have been shared with an interesting experience where ICANN was not able to transfer the [00:50:00 - inaudible] of funded travelers because they were not able to transfer dollars into the country. So with that in mind, if you think about the Applicant Support Program, then this might take us somewhere. And lastly, the ccTLDs and the government relation with the ccTLDs and the role of governments with ccTLDs was also one of the important topics we discussed. Sorry.

TRACY HACKSHAW: Excellent. No, that's great. So you've heard from Manal, give I think a summary of the Arab speaking countries.

MANAL ISMAIL: Arabic, yeah.

TRACY HACKSHAW: Arabic speaking countries. Exactly. Is that a region you would say, or would you say it's multiple regions in how you look at it? I'm just trying to address the GEs as is what regions.

MANAL ISMAIL: Part of the Arabic speaking countries fall within Africa and part within Asia Pacific, and Egypt is lucky enough to fall in--

---

TRACY HACKSHAW: Cross both.

MANAL ISMAIL: Yeah.

TRACY HACKSHAW: And you would say the issue kind of straddles both of those regions the similar issues.

MANAL ISMAIL: Exactly. So we belong to the Arab, African, and part of Asia Pacific as well, the Esquire.

TRACY HACKSHAW: All right. So let me ask the same question, but is there a different issue that you would like to raise? But if they're the same, feel free. So yes, I see Alisa, I know she would like to go first, so let's go.

ALISA HEAVER: Now it sounds like I want to jump the queue, but that's not the case. So on the topics for this week, that's more or less the same. We included DNS abuse mitigation to that as well. But for the future topics, so to say, something that should be discussed according to the African region was the functioning of AFRINIC as its RIR.

And so Ashwin had a very interesting point from Indonesia about space internet governance and Starlink and basically how Starlink and

---

the other space internet organizations get their IP addresses and how that functions. If he wants to comment on that further, I'm happy to hand over the mic to him because he knows a lot more about that. Yeah, I'll leave it with this.

TRACY HACKSHAW:

And actually, that's called interplanetary internet for those who don't know, that's a whole thing going on, and Vince is leading that discussion. So it's very interesting stuff going on there. All right. Maybe we could go with Chad.

TOMBOYE IBRAHIM:

Yes. In terms of IDN and Universal Acceptance, we talked about that and we mentioned that it was an interesting topic. In Africa, there are so many languages that we thought it was difficult to apply that to our regions. We also talked about new gTLDs. We also mentioned that perhaps the conditions of acquisition of new gTLD should be reviewed to attract more developing countries. We also talked about the obstacles, linguistic obstacles. And I think that's about it for our group.

TRACY HACKSHAW:

Any speaking group, and there's a slightly different question. So you've heard the other issues that have been raised in three and four, do you see anything specifically different in your region or the regions that you were covering, I should say, that would be divergent from this? And for those issues, if there are any, why do you think they're

---

different? And let me turn the question around again. Any of the issues that you just heard different for your region and why do you think they're different? So it's kind of the same question, but slightly different angles. Let's start with, China. Speak, yes.

WANG LANG:

Okay. And our group talked about the RDRs, that is Registration Data Request Service. In some circumstance we need to check and fetch the registration data and in a more secure and effective way. So we think it's very important to us.

TRACY HACKSHAW:

Excellent. Yeah, go.

THIAGO DAL TOE:

Tracy. So we spoke about the next round and also with regard to DNS abuse. It's interesting what you said there. We had a philosophical discussion to understand why DNS abuse in cybersecurity is so important for the region of Latin America and the Caribbean. We said that perhaps the region isn't sufficiently prepared or it might not have the capabilities, the tools, the knowledge. And that is what we talked about, how to increase or enhance knowledge about mitigation of DNS abuse.

We have specific cases, and I mentioned before the case of Costa Rica with the ransomware, which took place last year. Two weeks ago, Columbia and Chile suffered a ransomware attack. Now this isn't DNS abuse as such, but it can take place through a vector of DNS abuse.

---

And we said that as countries implement their cybersecurity agencies or their national digital security agencies, they require training and capacity building with regard to DNS abuse. So we applaud all of the efforts made by the GAC to provide this training and also bringing experts.

TRACY HACKSHAW: [00:56:37 - inaudible] and Latin America and the Caribbean. Is there a difference between there and-- Spain was in your group. Did you see any difference between what Spain would've said the LAC countries?

THIAGO DAL TOE: There are some differences. It has more to do with how they're established in each country. For example, which ministry is at the helm, who are the GAC representatives. But I think that the issues in general are linked or perhaps the delegate would like to speak on that.

TRACY HACKSHAW: Feedback on this, this topic. As we wind down, I'm going to finish it in a particular way. Does anybody have any questions or feedback, remote or otherwise? No. Doesn't seem so. Ah, there we go. Yes. Feel free to use the mic. Use a mic on your desk. Yeah. Okay. Let's see who you are please.

UNKNWON SPEAKER: Thank you. I will speak in French. I would like to thank all of the participants and also I would like to thank them for their important

---

role. But I do have a question. We heard the question and the answer to question two was the perception of ICANN by the government. So that's the question. But when we heard everyone, what we realized is that up to 70% of them perceive ICANN in a similar manner for all regions.

The governments really don't know the exact role of ICANN within the internet governance ecosystem. That's what I understand. And ICANN should work on that, we should be ambassadors of ICANN to our governments in order to help them understand the important role that ICANN has, and this concerns all governments. Many don't understand that if you don't have the DNS, you don't have the internet. Without the DNS, we don't have the internet.

Everybody has a terminal, communicates, sends messages. But how does one do that? How come governments don't understand how important that is? So we really need to work on that. And as I was listening to everyone, I believe that many governments truly have not comprehended how important the role of ICANN is.

Without ICANN, there would be so many issues at the international level. So we really need to have a better understanding. And I think that we need to be the actors of that understanding, of that awareness raising so that ICANN can be promoted. Thank you very much.

TRACY HACKSHAW:

It starts with us, as they say, to transmit that to our governments. So as you wrap up, I want to ask each one of you one key area in answering question five that you think is linking directly to what was

---

just said to that. How can we increase engagement participation in our various regions, in our countries, what came out of the discussions and what do you think actually, now that you are on stage? So let's start. Point a finger. No, I pointed at Chinese speaking.

WANG LANG:

Okay. Thank you. You see one point. We think we need to use more emerging technology such as AI to improve the activity of the participation in our region. In Asian Pacific region, English is not the native language in most of the country, so there's language barriers in our discussion and the communication. So if ICANN introduce some emerging technology to help us to avoid these language barriers, I think the participation will be increased.

TRACY HACSHAW:

So AI and emerging technology. All right. Thiago.

THIAGO DAL TOE:

For us with regard to this specific issue, we mentioned interacting with other kinds of organizations and regional events in order to boost participation of GAC members. That was one of our solutions for that problem.

CLIFFORD BOSTIC:

Yes. Thank you. So in a very, very short few words, this is what I would say that one, governments understand the importance of internet because if it fails, then there's no communication going across around



---

the world. But the problem here that we want to let you know is that very many moving parts of ICANN need to be understood by us so that we can participate more.

TRACY HACSHAW: So what's the one thing that we can do to improve that?

CLIFFORD BOSTIC: Simplify your processes.

TRACY HACSHAW: Simplify the process.

CLIFFORD BOSTIC: Simplify them, and simplify your communication to us.

TRACY HACSHAW: Simplify communication.

CLIFFORD BOSTIC: Yes. For every single thing that you're doing so we understand all the moving parts so that we can participate with all the moving parts.

TRACY HACSHAW: Thanks. Thank you.

---

CLIFFORD BOSTIC: Thank you.

TRACY HACSHAW: Manal.

MANAL ISMAIL: So after fully supporting the simplification that Barbados talked about, I think the main theme of our discussion was around better coordination among the region and maybe complimenting each other's knowledge if we have different leads on different topics than maybe if there is coordination before the meetings, coordination for the GAC advice to the Board. For example, we receive an email from the chair two weeks prior to the meeting. So if there is knowledge transfer and coordination prior to the meeting, I think it would help active participation during the meeting.

TRACY HACSHAW: Thank you. Alisa, perhaps you would like to go.

ALISA HEAVER: Yeah, I commented on this one.

TRACY HACSHAW: English group two or one. Yes.

---

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: So I might comment for my region, and it's a very, very simple suggestion. Have more equitable meetings in different regions in time zones. In the Asia Pacific region, it's incredibly difficult to dial into meetings at 1 and 2:00 AM to try and balance the burden across the European and the American time zones. I think when the meetings occur and we do get into a lot of intersectional work, there's very important work that happens on Zoom, we're just going to make sure that each region has a fair opportunity to participate during business hours. It's a simple barrier, I think.

ALISA HEAVER: Sorry, may I add one thing? So sorry, to add one thing. So we are here together with the ones who came and participate online, but I would also really want to ask ICANN Org to reach out to the countries that are not here and don't participate, but have officially registered to the GAC, and to ask them why are you not participating?

TRACY HACSHAW: Exactly.

ALISA HEAVER: And I'd be interested to know why they're not participating. So I'd actually like to call upon ICANN Org or the government engagement team to report back on this for us to understand why they don't want to come or why they can't come.

---

TRACY HACSHAW: I hope they're listening. All right. And we'll give the last word to our-- others a response. Okay. Let hold that and let's give the last comment on five from French speaking and then we'll go to the government GSC to actually respond. Go ahead.

TOMBOYE IBRAHIM: As far as we're concerned, we have proposed a platform that could be put together where we would be able to prepare the ICANN meetings. So the idea would be together and to talk about the different points of interest to us and to agree on those points so that when we come here, we can discuss those particular points, perhaps sharing best practices. We have human resources that have a lot of skills in the technical realm. We talked about Central Africa, but this is something that affects all of the French speaking countries.

TRACY HACSHAW: Excellent. So before we wrap up, I think that Mr. Albert Daniels would like to respond on behalf of the entire ICANN Org on everything that was just said. So Albert, you have a heavy load to respond.

ALBERT DANIELS: Thank you very much, Tracy, for putting my entire job at jeopardy with that statement.

TRACY HACSHAW: No problem.

---

ALBERT DANIELS:

I just have one quick comment in relation to asking those who are not here why they are not here. Well, first of all, Albert Daniels is the name and I work with the Stakeholder Engagement Team, which covers Latin America and the Caribbean. I have specific responsibility for covering the 32 territories of the Caribbean.

Earlier this year, we executed a SIDS survey, Small Island Developing State survey to ask the question and find out why it is that not only are the Caribbean, but developing countries are not participating as much as we feel they should. The results of that survey are actually going to be presented publicly at this meeting in a session at 16:40 on Tuesday. So it would be good for those of you who can attend to come to hear what the small island developing states had to say about the reasons why they are not participating as much in ICANN and the challenges that that they are facing.

And I think it would be good to have some sort of collaboration between what we are doing with that SIDS group and this effort that is taking place in the GAC. Because I think we'll find there's a lot of commonality. It's not just the Caribbean that are small island developing states, we have small island developing states in other parts of the world, and I'm sure we are quite familiar with that. So the LAC space at 4:30 on Tuesday afternoon is where we would be making a public presentation of the answers to that question that you were just asking.

TRACY HACSHAW:

So thank you very much, and time has run out completely on us. I thank the interpreters for spending just a few extra minutes with us.

---

Thank you all on the panel for being so cooperative and helping us get this information. A lot of stuff done. Thank you to all of you who engaged today. We are back here tomorrow, same time, more of this, more engagement, tech day. Look forward to seeing you. There's a GAC social right now, out the doors, don't leave, food and drink outside. Thank you very much. Well done. Thank you all.

**[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]**