
ICANN76 | CF – GAC Wrap-Up
Thursday, March 16, 2023 – 13:15 to 14:30 CUN

JULIA CHARVOLEN: Recording in progress. Welcome to the ICANN 76 GAC wrap-up session on Thursday 16 March at 13:15 local time. Please note that this session is being recorded and is governed by the ICANN expected standards of behavior. If you wish to speak, please raise your hand via Zoom. Remember to state your name and the language you will speak in case you will be speaking a language other than English. Speak clearly at a reasonable pace to allow for accurate interpretation and please make sure to mute all other devices when speaking. You may access all available features for this session in the zoom toolbar. With that, I will hand the floor over to the GAC chair, Manal Ismail. Manal please.

MANAL ISMAIL: Thank you very much, Julia and good morning, good afternoon, and good evening everyone. Welcome back to the GAC last session of the meeting. This is the GAC wrap-up session. As you all know, we will make a quick read through the communiqué and then do the wrap-up, but before that, allow me to acknowledge the presence of Vanda, chair of the NomCom, and Yrjö, member of the NomCom from ALAC Europe. And thank you, Vanda and Yrjö for reaching out to the GAC and coming to present to us here today. Over to you, Vanda, please.

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

VANDA SCARTEZINI:

Thank you Manal. Good evening, good morning, good afternoon for everyone here and online. So we have a quick presentation as to not waste your time. We are the Nominating Committee. The Nominating Committee is an independent, completely independent body inside the ICANN. We do not respond to the Board, we do not respond to Org or any other constituents, SOs or ACs.

So this is the last opportunity to members of your countries to apply for leadership positions that we're going to show to you. So that is the message that I would like you to take home and spread around and maybe someone from your countries will have the opportunity to join us in the next future. So after that, I will pass to my colleague Yrjö to say what we expect. Thank you.

YRJÖ LANSIPURO:

Thank you Vanda. Good afternoon, my name is Yrjö Lansipuro, representing EURALO, the European At-Large organization on the Nominating Committee. This is the GAC meeting, so I think I have to say first when ICANN is looking for leaders, there are two categories for which government employees, civil servants and elected officials are not eligible. That is to say the Board itself and the PTI Board, the post-transition IANA Board or public technical identifiers Board.

But apart from these, there are no restrictions to other bodies. And what I hope that you also, when you go back, talk to your colleagues, talk to your friends, because we really need good candidates. As always, the Nominating Committee is dependent on the candidate pool. If the candidate pool is good and large, we have a chance of selecting good leaders from ICANN. So can I have the next slide, please?

So while looking for leaders, we need two members for the ICANN board of directors and they can be from any region whatsoever. Next slide, please. So one member for the public technical identifiers, PTI board of directors. Next slide, please. And we need three regional representatives to the At-Large Advisory Committee, and that is precisely one from Africa, one from Asia, Australia and Pacific Islands region, and one from Latin America and the Caribbean region. Next, please.

Two members of the Generic Names Supporting Organization Council, and one for the Contracted Party House, and one for the Non-Contracted Party House. And finally, next slide, one member of the Country Code Names Supporting Organization, ccNSO. So these are the people we're looking for. In the interest of time, I think I adhere. I think the message is clear. Please ask people who you think would be good for these roles to apply. Thank you.

VANDA SCARTEZINI:

Next one, because it's the last date to go. Go one more, because the deadline to apply is next week. So 23 of March at one minute to midnight on UTC. So not much time, but the application is just filling, not complex at all. So you have the opportunity to share the idea again with all members from your communities in each country, and maybe we can get some of them very capacitated people to fill in our open positions. We thank you very much, and don't want to waste your time. Have a nice meeting. Thank you, Manal.

MANAL ISMAIL:

Thank you very much. Before you leave, any questions or any comments? Okay, seeing none, then thank you very much for reaching out, and thank you for coming to the GAC. Thank you. So if we can have the communique on the screen now, please.

So as agreed this morning, we will make the final read through the communique. Just to let you know, I've been working with GAC support staff to make sure if there are any abbreviations. We write them in full, everything is in tracked changes, and once we get through the reading, they will be accepted as we go. So without any further ado, let's get started.

So this is GAC communique, Cancun, Mexico. The Cancun communique was drafted and agreed in a hybrid setting. Sorry, yes, please, I intended to invite you, Nico, but thank you for joining. So the Cancun communique was drafted and agreed in a hybrid setting during the ICANN 76 community forum with some GAC participants in Cancun, Mexico, and others remotely. The communique was circulated to the GAC immediately after the meeting to provide an opportunity for all GAC members and observers to consider it before publication, bearing in mind the special circumstances of a hybrid meeting, and this will happen as soon as we finish the communique.

Then we have highlighted in yellow, no objections were raised during the agreed timeframe before publication, and this is just for you to see the final version, and this will not be unhighlighted until the review period ends, hopefully with no objections. Then under introduction, the text reads, the Governmental Advisory Committee, GAC, of the Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers, ICANN, met in Cancun,

Mexico, in a hybrid setting, including remote participation from 11 to 16 March 2023. 68 GAC members and six observers attended the meeting, and this is to our best counting until now. The figures will be reviewed, and that's why it's also still highlighted in yellow.

The GAC meeting was conducted as part of the ICANN 76 community forum. All GAC plenary and working group sessions were conducted as open meetings, and sorry to get us out of the communique, but today at the public forum, I heard an intervention asking that other parts of the community are starting to close their sessions, and they were asking them to be as open as the GAC, so just to convey that we are a reference for open sessions.

Under inter-constituency activities and community engagement, first our meeting with the ICANN board, the GAC met with the ICANN Board and discussed subsequent rounds of new gTLDs, further developments on DNS abuse mitigation, including CCT review recommendations and contract negotiations, WHOIS disclosure system, including law enforcement requests and features to be built into the system, ICANN's emergency assistance program, EAP, framework for continued Internet access, and curative rights protections for intergovernmental organizations.

Moving to the meeting with the At-Large Advisory Committee, ALAC, the GAC met with members of the ALAC and discussed follow-up on the 2017 joint GAC-ALAC advice to the Board entitled enabling inclusive, informed and meaningful participation at ICANN, a joint statement by ALAC and GAC. We also discussed the ICANN 76 plenary session on WSIS+20 review and furthering the multi-stakeholder model, and lastly

DNS abuse in the context of contemporary policy advancements coordinating the multi-stakeholder approach.

Moving on to the meeting with the Generic Names Supporting Organization, the GNSO, the GAC met with members of the GNSO Council and discussed subsequent rounds of new gTLDs, including the operational design assessment, closed generics, and the GNSO guidance process on applicant support, DNS abuse mitigation, who is disclosure system, accuracy of registration data, IGO protections, GNSO Council response to GAC communique issues of importance, and transparency in GNSO policy development process and statements of interest.

Now on the meeting with the Contracted Parties House, CPH of the GNSO, the GAC met with representatives of the contracted parties who discussed ongoing contractual negotiations regarding DNS abuse mitigation, ongoing GNSO discussions on the statement of interest, the SOI policy, and the abuse contract identifier tool referred to as acidtool.com.

Then under cross-community discussions, GAC members participated in relevant cross-community sessions scheduled as part of ICANN 76, including looking towards WSIS+20, how can we improve multi-stakeholder participation in Internet governance—and this is the title of the session.

Under internal matters, we have GAC membership. There are currently 181 GAC member states and territories and 38 observer organizations. Under GAC elections, the GAC elected representatives the GAC elected Wang Lang, China, as vice chair to fulfill the one-year term of

Shi Young Chang, Republic of Korea, ending at the close of ICANN 79, March 2024.

The requirements of GAC operating principles 32 and 35, regarding GAC vice chair elections, were satisfied as a total of 100 ballots, more than one-third of the GAC members, were submitted. There were no ties requiring further balloting.

Then, under GAC leadership, the GAC expressed its sincere appreciation to Manal Ismail for her dedication as GAC chair since 2017. Under her tenure, the GAC successfully navigated the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic, providing public policy advice and input in seven successive communiqués adopted in a virtual setting. Henceforth, extending the ability of its members to participate effectively in GAC consensus building.

The GAC thanked its outgoing vice chairs, Par Brumark from Niue, Shi Young Chang, Republic of Korea, and Jaideep Kumar Mishra, India, for their valuable support and contributions to the GAC.

The end of the ICANN 76 meeting marks the start of a new term for the incoming GAC chair vice chairs team. Nicolas Caballero, Paraguay, as a chair, Ola Bergstrom, Sweden, Francis Olivier Cubahiro, Burundi, Zeina Bou Harb, Lebanon, Nigel Hickson, United Kingdom, and Wang Lang from China.

The incoming GAC chair and vice chairs participated in the ICANN leadership training program preceding the ICANN 76 meeting. The GAC encourages ICANN to continue offering this valuable curriculum. Under

GAC working groups, the GAC endorses the Public Safety Working Group 2023-2024 work plan.

And then we have the reporting back from our working groups. First, the GAC Public Safety Working Group. The GAC public safety working group, PSWG, continued its work to advocate for improved measures to combat DNS abuse and promote effective access to domain name registration data. The PSWG participated in the capacity building workshop supporting the orientation of new GAC members on the importance of who is data and mitigating DNS abuse.

The PSWG also led a session to update the GAC on DNS abuse that included, one, a presentation on UK and US cybercrime statistics and how they relate to the DNS, two, updates on various initiatives from the community to support the mitigation of DNS abuse. Three, a presentation by the Internet and Jurisdiction Policy Network detailing their suggested framework for when it is appropriate to act at the DNS level to address technical and website content related abuse. And four, discussion on how the PSWG could work with the GAC to forward pertinent work within the ICANN community.

The PSWG continued its active participation to support the GAC small group that focuses on domain name registration issues. The PSWG noted the importance of accurate registration data and the ability to identify the most relevant entity to disrupt and investigate DNS abuse. The PSWG also participated in the update to the GAC on domain name registration data issues.

With regard to ICANN Org's proposed design of a proof-of-concept WHOIS disclosure system, soon to be renamed the registration data

request service, the PSWG noted the response from ICANN Org indicating that a lack of functionality to maintain the confidentiality of requests of law enforcement agencies and highlights that this will likely lead to a reduced engagement from this significant user group of the system. The PSWG continued its outreach, holding discussions with a number of constituent groups within ICANN and public safety bodies.

Moving to the GAC Underserved Regions Working Group, the USRWG. The Underserved Regions Working Group collaborated with ICANN Org teams to hold a capacity development workshop on Saturday 11 March 2023. The topics discussed were suggested based on the pre-workshop survey of the GAC. First, introduction to ICANN, to the role of the GAC and to the policy development process, and second, the policy topics of importance to the GAC, DNS abuse, subsequent rounds of new gTLDs and who is, including a regional perspective. During ICANN 76 GAC plenary sessions, it was agreed that DNS abuse should form the basis of the next wave of GAC capacity building interventions in the lead-up to and at ICANN 77.

A post-workshop survey was shared with GAC participants in order to enhance future workshops. Going forward, the Underserved Regions Working Group plans to continue organizing capacity development activities, including, but not limited to, additional workshops and webinars. GAC members noted their appreciation to the Underserved Regions Working Group for holding this capacity development workshop and thanked the GAC topic leads and presenters from the SSAC, ccNSO and ICANN Org for their contributions.

Regarding the GAC working group on human rights and international law, the Human Rights and International Law Working Group updated the GAC on its activities regarding the implementation of Work Stream 2 recommendation 1 on diversity, including the work of the Work Stream 2 Community Coordination Group, CCG, on developing tools to help the community implement a number of subset recommendations.

Additionally, the working group reminded the GAC about the process and submission of the fiscal year 2024 additional budget request on sign language at ICANN meetings.

TRACY HACKSHAW: Excuse me, Manal, excuse me.

MANAL ISMAIL: Yes, Tracy, please.

TRACY HACKSHAW: Yes, I think there might be an error in the Underserved Regions Working Group. We had moved the, during the 19th, the ICANN 76 GAC plenary sessions that was agreed, etc., to the main DNS abuse and I think it's still retained there. Yeah, so it should—delete it from there. Thank you.

MANAL ISMAIL: Right, thank you very much for noticing this and yeah, we agreed to put this under DNS abuse. Thank you very much, Tracy. So now the GAC Operating Principles Evolution Working Group. The GAC Operating

Principles Evolution Working Group finalized its review of the preliminary analysis of GAC operating principles.

This will be used as a basis to initiate discussions and prioritize the review of the GAC operating principles. Interested GAC members are invited to participate in the working group upcoming discussions. The working group will resume its meetings post ICANN 76 and update the GAC of their intersessional work at ICANN 77.

Now on the GAC Universal Acceptance and Internationalized Domain Names Working Group, the new chair of the Universal Acceptance and Internationalized Domain Names Working Group briefed the GAC on recent working group activities and plans for the coming calendar year. Regarding universal acceptance, GAC members were reminded of the upcoming Universal Acceptance Day 2023 taking place in 53 locations throughout the world on 28 March 2023 to raise awareness and encourage universal acceptance adoption.

GAC members were encouraged to contribute and support such efforts annually in their region where possible. The working group intends to review experience gained during that day and consider potential work efforts available to either the GAC or individual governments.

Regarding internationalized domain names, the latest update was presented to the GAC in a recent pre-ICANN 76 GAC webinar. The ongoing GNSO expedited policy development process on IDNs in which the UK and India representatives' contribution was acknowledged is expected to deliver an initial report around April 2023 and a final report before the end of the year. These will be considered by working group members in due course.

Appreciation was expressed for the newly resumed activities of the working group. GAC members were encouraged to join and contribute to the work of the universal acceptance and IDNs working group, including exploring opportunities for future briefing of the committee. Moving to section four on issues of importance to the GAC. First, under subsequent rounds of new gTLDs, the GAC notes the results of the operational design assessment as well as the upcoming ICANN board vote on most of the recommendations from the new gTLD subsequent procedures policy development process at ICANN 76 with the view to initiating policy implementation required to prepare for subsequent rounds of new gTLDs.

The GAC welcomes continued consideration by the ICANN board before a vote on the topics of registry voluntary commitments, public interest commitments, GAC advice and early warnings, auctions of last resort, community applications, closed generics and applicant support. These topics continue to be a priority for the GAC. The GAC recalls its previous input on these matters and underscores its willingness to engage with the board and the rest of the community in their resolution.

In view of the initial outputs from the facilitated dialogue group on closed generics involving representatives from the GAC, GNSO and At-Large, the GAC acknowledges the importance of this work which needs to address multiple challenges. While the GAC continues to be committed to the facilitated dialogue, no policy option including the prohibition of closed generics should be excluded if no satisfactory solution is found. In any event, any potential solution would be subject to the GAC's consensus agreement.

The GAC reaffirms the importance of increasing the number and geographical distribution of applications from underrepresented regions in future rounds of new GTLDs through the applicant support program. The GAC reiterates its support for proposals to reduce or eliminate ongoing ICANN registry fees to expand financial support in order to sufficiently cover all applications.

Also, GAC members will continue to engage in the GNSO guidance process on applicant support with the aim of fostering gTLD applications from a diverse array of applicants. Finally, the GAC stresses the importance of raising awareness of the applicant support program, including providing applicants with comprehensive information and sufficient time to prepare for the program.

Under DNS abuse, the GAC welcomes the fact that the contracted parties proactively initiated contract negotiations with ICANN to improve existing obligations related to domain name system abuse. The creation of effective and enforceable requirements for registrars and registries to disrupt or mitigate DNS abuse will represent a positive and concrete first step in addressing this important topic area at ICANN.

The GAC encourages the negotiations to proceed expeditiously and looks forward to providing feedback on the proposed amendments during the public comment period. Presentations during ICANN 76 by the Public Safety Working Group and the Internet and Jurisdiction Policy Network, as well as discussions with the contracted parties and the At-Large Advisory Committee, provided the GAC with a diverse range of information to inform the GAC for the upcoming public comment period.

The GAC considers that continued efforts in this area will be required, including further improvement of contractual obligations and or targeted policy development processes prior to the launch of a second round of new generic top-level domains.

The GAC would like to reiterate that maintaining accurate and complete domain name registration data is an important element in the prevention and mitigation of DNS abuse, and encourages the contracted parties and ICANN to further consider inter alia proactive measures, as well as positive incentives for registries and registrars in future work on DNS abuse mitigation or disruption.

The GAC also welcomed information regarding the abuse contact identifier tools, the acidtool.com, provided by the Registrar Stakeholder Group to identify the appropriate parties to whom DNS abuse should be reported.

During ICANN 76 GAC plenary sessions, it was agreed that DNS abuse should form the basis of the next wave of GAC capacity building interventions in the lead-up to and at ICANN 77. Under registration data consensus policy, the text reads the GAC welcomes the implementation work on the registration data consensus policy, deriving from the expedited policy development process team phase one final recommendations, and appreciated the opportunity to provide feedback as part of the public comment process.

The GAC supports the EPDP team's efforts to develop a policy that complies with existing data protection principles, while establishing clearly defined minimum data elements that allow contracted parties

to process data in line with the relevant obligations within their jurisdictions.

At the same time, the GAC looks forward to receiving the implementation review team's analysis and response to the public comments, including inter alia, the issue of response times to urgent requests to ensure that responses to such requests are in fact expedited in a manner consistent with an emergency response.

Defining urgent requests to include those involving imminent or ongoing cyber security incidents, avoiding the risk of implementing a partial system resulting in a policy gap by, among other things, resolving inconsistencies between the phase one recommendation regarding the optional collection of the registrant organization and the subsequent phase two recommendation to require the functionality of distinguishing between legal and natural persons.

Fourth, clarifying the obligation for contracted parties to enter into a data protection agreement. Fifth, requiring the collection and publication of reseller data. And finally, clarifying the policy's impact on the thick WHOIS transition policy.

Under WHOIS disclosure system, the text reads, the GAC welcomes the launch of a proof of concept WHOIS disclosure system soon to be renamed registration data request service to generate data that can inform further community discussion on phase two of the expedited policy development process and the recommendations on the system for standardized access and disclosure, which are currently on hold.

In line with the GAC's discussions with the board and the GNSO at ICANN 76, the GAC notes the importance of maximizing voluntary participation in the system, including through potential incentive structures. Moving to accuracy of registration data, the text reads, the GAC would like to reiterate that maintaining accurate and complete domain name registration data is an important element in the prevention and mitigation of DNS abuse.

The GAC recognizes the importance of revisiting recommendations one and two from the accuracy scoping team at such time that the data protection agreement negotiations between ICANN Org and the contracted parties have completed and there is feedback from ICANN.org or after a period of six months, whichever is shorter.

The GAC encourages resuming the work of the accuracy scoping team at whichever comes first. As per the scoping team's recommendations, undertaking a registrar survey and a registrar audit will help to inform the GAC's consideration of further work on these issues. Under transparency in GNSO participation, the GAC strongly supports transparency at ICANN and takes note of ongoing discussions within the GNSO on disclosure obligations under the GNSO's statement of interest policy.

GAC members expressed deep concern about the GAC's proposed exception in the SOI that might permit GNSO participants to refrain from disclosing the identity of the entities they represent in GNSO working groups. The GAC looks forward to further engagement with the GNSO on this issue.

Fifth topic under issues of importance to the GAC is emergency assistance program, and the text here reads the GAC acknowledges the information received from the ICANN board on this program and looks forward to receiving more information on expected dates, criteria, and modalities of implementation, including potential partners for further consideration. And we have added here criteria based on the proposal from Lebanon.

Going to section five, GAC consensus advice to the Board. The following items of advice from the GAC to the Board have been reached on the basis of consensus as defined in the ICANN bylaws. First, IGO protections. The GAC advises the board to proceed with the approval of the recommendations of the EPDP on specific curative rights protections for implementation and to maintain the current moratorium on the registration of IGO acronyms as domain names in new gTLDs presently in place until the full implementation of the recommendations of the EPDP on specific curative rights protections.

Moving to the rationale, the GAC affirms that IGOs perform important global missions with public funds, that they are the unique treaty-based creations of governments under international law, and that their names and acronyms warrant appropriate tailored protection in the DNS in the global public interest to prevent consumer harm. It is also recalled that the EPDP recommendations strike a balance between rights and concerns of both IGOs and legitimate third parties.

In considering approving the recommendations of the EPDP on specific curative rights protections for implementation, the GAC notes that the EPDP recommendations received full consensus and that the

corresponding GNSO council vote to approve said recommendations was unanimous. Insofar as the above-noted EPDP recommendations propose targeted amendments to the UDRP rules to accommodate IGOs in addressing the abuse of IGO identifiers in the DNS, this advice supersedes those aspects of GAC advice in the following communiqués as follows.

In the GAC Los Angeles communiqué, ICANN 51, section 4.5.B.I, in implementing any such curative mechanisms, the UDRP should not be amended. Second, in the GAC Hyderabad communiqué, ICANN 57, section 6.4.2, a dispute resolution mechanism modeled on but separate from the UDRP, which provides in particular for appeal to an arbitral tribunal instead of national courts in conformity with relevant principles of international law.

And third, in the GAC Johannesburg communiqué, ICANN 59, section 6.1.A, the GAC reiterates its advice that IGO access to curative dispute resolution mechanism should, one, be modeled on but separate from the existing UDRP, two, provide standing based on IGO status as public intergovernmental institutions, and three, respect IGOs' jurisdictional status by facilitating appeals exclusively through arbitration.

In terms of the continuation of the moratorium, in the ICANN 71 communiqué, in advising the Board to maintain the current moratorium on the registration of IGO acronyms as domain names in new GTLDs pending the conclusion and implementation of the recommendations of the IGO curative work track, the GAC noted that in the absence of access to a curative rights protection mechanism, a mere notification of the registration of a domain name corresponding

to its identifier is of no real utility to an IGO because an IGO has no current ability to arbitrate a domain name dispute.

In that same light, the GAC previously has advised the Board to maintain the current moratorium in the ICANN 61 San Juan, ICANN 62 Panama, and ICANN 71 communiques, noting that the removal of interim protections before a permanent decision is taken on a curative mechanism to protect IGO acronyms could result in irreparable harm to IGOs.

Second topic under GAC advice to the Board, who is disclosure system, and the GAC advises the Board to direct ICANN Org to promptly engage with the PSWG to identify and advance solutions for confidentiality of law enforcement requests, so as not to preclude participation by law enforcement requests when measuring usage of the WHOIS disclosure system.

Moving on to the rationale, the GAC welcomes the Board's February 27, 2023 resolution approving the launch of a proof-of-concept approach for a WHOIS disclosure system intended to gather demand and usage data to inform community discussions and Board consideration of the phase two recommendations of the expedited policy development process.

In the GAC Kuala Lumpur communique under issues of importance, the GAC stressed, quotes, the importance of including a mechanism to allow for confidential law enforcement requests, end quote, and recommended that ICANN Org engage, quote, with the GAC PSWG to further discuss the issue of how confidentiality of law enforcement

requests will be ensured and how the metadata of all the requests of law enforcement agencies will be handled, end quote.

To date, this engagement has not taken place. Nevertheless, during the GAC meetings with ICANN Board, ICANN Org indicated that the proposed system design would not provide functionality for maintaining confidentiality for law enforcement requests.

Law enforcement agencies' investigations may be compromised if requests for domain registration data are not kept confidential. A lack of functionality in the proposed WHOIS disclosure system to provide for such functionality will almost certainly deter usage of the system by law enforcement agencies, which will in turn decrease the amount of data that the pilot program will be able to collect.

The GAC highlights that further engagement between ICANN Org and the PSWG is necessary to resolve this issue. A satisfactory approach to this concern is also consistent with the Board's resolution, quote, to encourage comprehensive system usage by data requesters, end quote. Sorry, Laureen, please go ahead.

LAUREEN KAPIN:

Yes, I think that there's a mistake with functionality repeated twice. It should be, the second one should be confidentiality. A lack of functionality in the proposed WHOIS disclosure system to provide for such confidentiality, not functionality. So it's the second functionality that should be replaced with confidentiality. Thank you.

MANAL ISMAIL:

Thank you, Lauren. So third topic under GAC consensus advice to the Board is the privacy and proxy services. And here we are suggesting to shorten, just to mention privacy and proxy services and not necessarily the whole long title. So I think we're good to reflect this.

The GAC advises the Board first to prioritize the assessment related to the pending RDS WHOIS 2 review recommendation R10.1, which called for the Board to monitor the implementation of the PPSAI policy recommendations and all necessary steps to resume this implementation consistent with the intent of the GAC's previous advice. And two, to regularly update the GAC on the status of activities related to privacy and proxy services. And there is a small change here. We inserted related to, instead of just to reflect what's being said in bullet number two.

Moving on to the rationale, the GAC notes in the recent quarterly report on ICANN specific reviews, 21 February 2023, that, quote, it is anticipated that ICANN Org may begin to work on the impact assessment of the outcomes of ongoing community work in Q1 2023 to inform Board action on recommendation 10.1, end quote, of the second registration directory service review, RDS WHOIS 2.

Recommendation R10.1 provides for the ICANN board to monitor the implementation of the privacy proxy services accreditation policy recommendations and thus implicates the previous GAC advice in Kobe communique and the GAC's follow-up on previous advice within the Montreal communique.

And finally, under section six, the next meeting, the GAC is scheduled to meet next during the ICANN 77 policy forum in Washington DC,

United States on 12 to 15 June 2023. So this concludes the—thank you for bearing. Yes.

NICOLAS CABALLERO: Ladies and gentlemen, let's give a big round of applause to the outgoing GAC chair, Manal Ismail.

MANAL ISMAIL: Thank you, Nico. I see a hand up from Iran. Please go ahead.

KAVOUSS ARASTEH: Thank you very much. Do you hear me, please? Yes, yes. Nico went out and brought a glass of water for himself. I told that he had been brought a glass of water for you as well, or you have taken some water because reading this long text like a notary office is sometimes, I'm not saying bothering, but it is troublesome for the readers and so on. For us, no matter because some of us has been already in notary office for something. So that is that.

I have one small clarification. At the top of the text, talking about number of GAC membership, member participate. I don't know whether it is number physically attended or include those who also virtually attended.

MANAL ISMAIL: It's both.

KAVOUSS ARASTEH: Yeah, did you mention that attended physically and virtually or ...? Because I thought that is talking only physically, from 181, only 68.

MANAL ISMAIL: So we tend to report on both collectively. We don't really now segregate between those who participated in person and those who participated remotely. So this should be collectively. So it says in a hybrid setting.

KAVOUSS ARASTEH: Another question is that, please correct me, is it in the principles or operating principle that the chair of the GAC should like a notary office read all these which has been read at least two or three or four times or just demonstrate or highlight the paragraph on the screen a little bit higher or bigger font and ask for that I don't know. I don't remember whether we have anything in that. I know the ICANN resolution should be read like a notary office by [Board and so on.] I don't know about the communique, whether it is needed to be read. It may be a little bit too much work for the chair of the GAC. Thank you.

MANAL ISMAIL: Thank you. Thank you, Iran. I don't think it's written somewhere and it's going to be up to you and Nico to decide. You as GAC members, I mean. So we try to make a one full reading at the end and we have already identified a couple of fixes. But again, I think it's based on how the GAC collectively decides. So it's up to you. But it's not written anywhere. So shall I announce the communique adopted? I mean finalized, not adopted. And please expect it to be in your inboxes shortly after this session, and as agreed, 72 hours and it becomes adopted and posted by

the Monday. So thank you very much for your cooperation and flexibility. Thank you.

ROBERT HOGGARTH:

Manal's whispered up to me that I look very suspicious. I don't know why that would be the case. Thank you, Manal. Now would normally be the time in the agenda for us to review the past week and look forward to action items for the committee to be addressing in the next period.

What we're going to do now is shift gears a little bit. Staff will generate its own email for purposes of summarizing the meeting, identifying future dates and the rest. But due to overwhelming demand, we're going to return to the rest of the meeting today to allow a number of GAC members to express their thanks to you, Manal, and share goodbyes. We had an overwhelming demand for people to speak. I don't think we had planned for a 47-minute reading of the GAC communique at the wrap-up session. But our wonderful interpreters and scribes have agreed to stick around a little bit longer. I have a queue of individuals and representatives who would like to speak. We've shared that list ahead of time. We had set a limit of two minutes per person. I'd ask folks to be as brief as possible. At the end of the meeting, if some of you can stick around, we are going to do a photograph with Manal up here on the stage looking back down with all of you, maybe gathered around, one of those classic selfie looks. So if you can do that, please, that would be much appreciated. But we will be going over just a little bit. We're going to start with the remote participants who are going to speak first and then go to the live folks. And so we'll get started with this list in the queue. Mistura, Jorge, Afiq Ammar, that's Mohamed

from Malaysia, Giacomo, Slava, Nigel, Alisa, and Raza from Pakistan. So Mistura, if you can hear us and connect, please proceed.

MISTURA ARUNA: Hello. Can you hear me?

ROBERT HOGGARTH: Yes, we can. And I forgot to note that we are going to have a timer. Folks had talked about experimenting with a timer. So you might hear a nice little polite bell if you exceed your time. Thank you.

MISTURA ARUNA: Okay. Thank you. Good morning. Good afternoon. Good evening, everyone. Manal, thank you so much, Manal. I personally appreciate you. And I must say that you're a very great leader. You're very attentive. And your display of humility is one thing I actually want to emulate. Soft spoken Manal, like I call you. Thank you for your support when I applied to be a mentor, to represent the GAC during the fellowship session. And you granted. And anytime you see me on the corridor, you say to me, thank you, Mistura, for representing us well.

So Manal, I just want to wish you all the best. You are an inspiration. You are a pride to us in Africa. And I pray almighty God we guide you as you go forth. Thank you. Thank you. Thank you. On behalf of Nigeria, we say thank you for your unique and exemplary leadership. Thank you so much. Thank you.

ROBERT HOGGARTH: Thank you, Mistura. We'll hold the applause till the end. We have 30 folks. Jorge, please.

JORGE CANCIO: Sure. Dear chair, dear GAC leader, dear Manal, two minutes aren't enough to render tribute to you. But let me try at least to thank you. A big thank you for your incredible service to the GAC and your absolute reliability. For your coolness when the heat of the debate rises. For your fairness in driving us time and again to consensus. For your wisdom in steering our ship through uncharted waters during the pandemic. For your openness and drive to innovate and trying new things out, which has allowed the GAC to grow in influence and esteem throughout the community. And the list could go on for hours. So let me thank you very personally for being such an excellent, warm, sensible, and sensitive human being. Dear Manal, it's been an honor and absolute privilege working with you and serving with you in the GAC leadership team. Thank you. And thank you on behalf of the Swiss government.

ROBERT HOGGARTH: Thank you, Jorge. Mohamed Afiq Ammar Tulos, if we can connect with you.

MOHAMED AFIQ AMMAR TULOS : All right. On behalf of the GAC Malaysia, I would like to take this opportunity to show appreciation to Manal for her great work and enthusiasm in coordinating the GAC meeting during her tenure. I must say that it is not an easy task to chair and coordinate the GAC, which brings together more than 100 delegations representing countries and

economies with different backgrounds, expertise, and interests. Ensuring that no one is left behind and everyone has the same and equal chance to speak is absolutely challenging.

I remember the first time I attended the GAC meeting back in 2019. I am so surprised by her gestures and calmness in chairing the meeting, even when the situation becomes a bit tense at times. She remains composed and elegant, suggesting true professionalism and fantastic leadership.

Considering myself still as the new blood of the GAC, I believe Manal will continue to inspire the existing, the incoming, and the future member of the GAC. Like how she indirectly taught me of becoming more calmer and attentive.

Having said that, I believe that this will not be the last time that we will prosper. Maybe there will be more in the future with greater and bigger achievements, I believe. With that, on behalf of the GAC Malaysia, we would like to say terima kasih dan selamat maju jaya. Thank you.

ROBERT HOGGARTH:

Thank you very much. Giacomo, you're next, sir.

GIACOMO MAZZONE:

Thank you. I want to salute Manal because under her leadership, I think we have got the evidence that it's possible to work all together and to find consensus on most of the issues, even the more controversial. Thanks to her calm approach and her respect towards all GAC members without difference between small or big, north or south, observer or

governments, etc. Everybody felt considered and listened. And this is an essential prerequisite to create an atmosphere for cooperation and trust. I'm deeply convinced that this achievement has been made possible thanks to the personality of Manal that I have the pleasure to know and appreciate for more than 20 years, since she was a young girl.

She was at the time one of the members of the dream team of the Minister Tarek Kamel, with Christina, Nermeen and other dear colleagues. And unfortunately, Kamel left too early, leaving many orphans. But if he was in the team the impetus, the pressure and the stance, Manal was the moment for reflection, diplomacy and search for consensus. A lesson that she never forgot and she put in practice at the leadership of GAC.

Now she's changing her role, but I'm sure that this will not change her dedication to ICANN and to the international cooperation in the world of Internet governance. So long live to Manal, and especially long live to her leadership method that I hope will survive to her and will stay with the GAC forever. Thank you very much, Manal.

ROBERT HOGGARTH: Thank you, Giacomo. Slava?

MANAL ISMAIL: I don't have enough tissues.

ROBERT HOGGARTH: Julia or Gulden, perhaps we can help in that regard. Slava, we can turn the microphone to you.

VIACHESLAV EROKHIN: Dear Manal and dear colleagues, on behalf of the Russian government organizations who took part in GAC and ICANN, and from me personally, I would like to thank you for your effective and efficient work as GAC chairperson. All of us, all GAC colleagues who have ever worked with you, some of us worked with you less, some more, but we've always seen your professionalism, your involvement in the process, your effectiveness, your diplomacy.

But I would also like to give you some other feedback. As GAC chairperson, you've participated in ICANN work, and you've also interacted with other committees and working groups and the Board and with representatives of the Russian Internet community, the domain industry, who have worked with you outside ICANN, outside GAC, and they've always referred to me and they've always told me, you're so lucky to have a chairperson like this. GAC has the most wonderful chairperson, always flexible, always prepared, always diplomatic. Even those specialists who worked with you for a short time saw your professionalism and your dedication to our common deed. Thank you so very much for your work. I would like to wish you the best of success in your further career. Thank you very much, dear colleagues.

ROBERT HOGGARTH: Next speaker, Nigel Cassimire. Nigel, if you can connect.

NIGEL CASSIMIRE: Good morning, good afternoon, good evening to all. On behalf of the Caribbean Telecommunications Union, I would like to express our

sincere appreciation and congratulations to you, Manal, for your exemplary leadership of ICANN's GAC in your extended tenure since 2017.

As said in the communique, you've [inaudible] over a period of unprecedented change in the life of ICANN and indeed in our lifetimes, transitioning from in-person to virtual and now hybrid meetings, sharing the pain of time zone differences when necessary, and while sustaining the progress and the work of the GAC.

Through it all, your leadership has been steadfast, efficient, focused, skillful, inclusive, gracious, most gracious, and ultimately effective. Your tenure has demonstrated the value of us tapping the potential of each member of the GAC, whether from developed or developing country, whether man or woman, to serve for the collective good. And you have also shown that good leadership in international affairs can be both firm and humble. Thank you, Manal, for stepping forward and for stepping up. And as you step down, please do not step away. We hope that your experience and influence would not be lost to the GAC, but that you are able to continue inspiring your country colleagues, the GAC, and the wider ICANN community to contribute towards delivering on our global aspiration of one world and one Internet. Godspeed, Manal, and thank you again.

ROBERT HOGGARTH:

Thank you very much, Nigel. Alisa Heaver, you're next in the queue.

ALISA HEAVER:

Thank you. Good morning, afternoon, and evening, all. Dear Manal, on behalf of the Netherlands, I would like to thank you for chairing the GAC with a lot of patience, humor, and a very good eye for compromise. A very, very good eye for compromise. You have done an outstanding job. I would also like to thank the government of Egypt for allowing you to spend sufficient time for this role. After several online meetings, we had the pleasure to meet in The Hague, my hometown. Unfortunately, I couldn't make it to this meeting in Cancun, and therefore cannot thank you in person. But I hope to be able to thank you next time at the next meeting in Washington, D.C. I wish you all the best in your future endeavors, hopefully also in the GAC and otherwise in other organizations. Once again, thank you, Manal. And finally, I do also wish Nico good luck in his new role as chair. Thank you.

ROBERT HOGGARTH:

Thank you, Alisa. Raza Sukhera, can you connect with us, please?

ZAKIR SYED:

Hi, this is Zakir Syed from GAC Pakistan team, I'll be talking on behalf of my colleague Raza Sukhera. So I take the opportunity to thank Manal Ismail, who has been instrumental, not only as GAC chair, but as part of the wider ICANN community. I've been working very closely with Manal, not only here at GAC, but at the ICANN Middle East space at ICANN meetings, as well as at the strategy working group, the regional strategy working group. And I can confirm that Manal's contributions to the wider ICANN community has been instrumental. It was during the leadership, during the chair role of Manal, that GAC has evolved, not only in terms of the number of members of GAC, but in terms of the

contributions that GAC has been doing to the wider ICANN community. So I take the opportunity to congratulate for the excellent work that Manal has been doing as chair of the GAC on behalf of the government of Pakistan, as well as on behalf of the regional community, because Manal's voice within the ICANN regional community has been instrumental. Manal has contributed a lot to the ICANN's regional work as well as globally as part of the GAC as well.

And apart from that, Manal, as earlier we mentioned it, Universal Acceptance Day is being celebrated in 50 plus places across the globe on 28th of March. So Pakistan, as a GAC member, is one of those 50 plus members. So I invite all the regional community members to be part of this day with us, because it would be a hybrid session. So again, thank you very much, Manal. And we are sure that we'll be around at the GAC so that the GAC as well as the ICANN community benefit from your experience. Thank you very much, Manal. Thank you. Bye.

ROBERT HOGGARTH:

Thank you very much. That is the remote participation. We're now going to turn to in-room participants as well. I would like to make sure that everybody sticks to their time. And again, thank the scribes and interpreters. I'd also like to alert you that, of course, people are putting comments in the chat. Please feel free to do that. We'll be collecting those inputs as well to share with Manal. The first few speakers in our queue, to give you an advance warning, Kavouss, Pua, Ashwin, Ana, Nigel, and [[Zaina],] please be prepared. And I'll turn the floor over to you, Kavouss, for the first in-person intervention. Thanks.

KAVOUSS ARASTEH:

Thank you very much. I am on the first because of the alphabetical. I'll start with A, no other discriminations or things that I wonder. Then before starting to say something, just I had wished to request my distinguished chair, Manal, that I had a point to raise to her. I'll come to that at the end of the meeting under any other business.

Now, to be short, in the communique, there is a paragraph of appreciation. I echo that paragraph. A little bit short. And then, I think if I'm not mistaken, the year of the service of Manal to ICANN is about the same age of the ICANN, about 20 years or more. So that is a long period and long experience. Manal, thank you very much for your patience. Thank you for dedication. Thank you for your efforts. And thank you for devotion during these six years. I wish you all the best. Thank you very much.

ROBERT HOGGARTH:

Thank you. Pua, you're next.

PUA HUNTER:

Thank you. I had the great honor and privilege of serving as a vice chair for two years under Manal's able leadership as chair. And in that time and also during my attendance to GAC, I have learned that you don't have to be controlling, you don't have to be forceful or overbearing to gain the support, the confidence, and the trust of your colleagues. Speaking on behalf of my GAC colleagues from the Pacific Islands and GAC members from the underserved regions who could not participate or deliver their respective statements, I would like to take this opportunity to convey a heartfelt appreciation to you, Manal, for the

sacrifices you made over the last six years to fulfill the duties of the GAC chair.

We admire you, Manal. We honor you and we respect you for your consistent composure and exceptional ability to progress the complex and challenging discussions of the GAC and related meetings of ICANN, while at the same time ensuring that the outcomes of our deliberations are ultimately for the long-term and best interests of ICANN's multi-stakeholder model.

We recognize your patience, we recognize your strength, we recognize your tolerance, humility, wisdom, and leadership. You are truly an amazing and inspirational woman, and we wish you all the very best in your future professional and personal journeys. Thank you, and God bless.

ROBERT HOGGARTH: Thank you, Pua. Ashwin, you're next.

ASHWIN SASTROSBUBROTO: Well, first of all, Manal, I would like to apologize because my English is not as good as my other colleagues, you see. That's why when you are talking about communicate, it is difficult for me to distinguish between may or should or must or would or whatever. But I would like to thank you because with your patience and tolerance, you can handle the what you call it, the comment for all the GAC members, whether it is regarding sensitive issues or with a strong voice or with a nice spoken voice and so on, you can handle all of them and we always have finally a nice communicate on time. That is important for all of us, also

important for the GAC ICANN and a good result for the GAC meetings. So on behalf of GAC Indonesia, I would like to thank you, and it's really nice for me to have a work with you. I consider you as my personal friend. I always call you my GAC lady from Egypt, because Egypt and Indonesia also has a long close relationship. So thanks again, Manal. Thank you.

ROBERT HOGGARTH:

Thank you, Ashwin. Ana, if I can turn the microphone over to you.

ANA NEVES:

Manal, I wanted to take the floor today to share with all GAC members that back in ICANN 53 in Buenos Aires in June 2015, we were the only GAC members who stayed together at a hotel, 10-15 minutes walking distance from the convention center. And we took breakfast and walk together to the GAC meeting every day. And during these walks, I told you that you should apply for the GAC chair position. And you always told me, no, of course not, Ana. But I was so right. And here we are in ICANN 76, March 2023.

This is my tribute to you. You were a very kind, fair, sorry, trustful and wisdom GAC chairwoman. Portugal always felt that GAC was on very good hands. Even when I've stepped down from GAC during three years, I've acknowledged how brave you were and how competent you were during COVID pandemic. You are a brilliant, very competent and an extraordinary human being. Respect. Thank you.

ROBERT HOGGARTH: Thank you, Ana. Nigel, you have the floor.

NIGEL HICKSON: Thank you. I tore up my script. I think it goes unsaid. Your qualities go unsaid. You're a brilliant leader. You're a brilliant facilitator. You've been simply brilliant as GAC chair. All these things are known and have been eloquently put far better than I could possibly do by power and others. I just want to say what a wonderful person you are. We both share something. We go back a long way. We worked together for many years in different capacities. But we shared a boss together, Tarek Kamel, who was your boss for many years and was my boss in Geneva in the government engagement team.

And he, I think, inspired us. He certainly inspired me. And I like to think that we got something from him. I'm sure you did. I know I did as well. A spirit that we should always listen to everyone. A spirit that we should be friends with people. That we should respect their cultures, their religions, their backgrounds, whatever. And I think that is something that you have brought to the GAC and has made you such an effective leader. Thank you.

ROBERT HOGGARTH: Thank you, Nigel. Before you go, [Zaina], if I can just alert Gabriella, Susan, Suada, Ian, and Guo Feng, you're next up in the queue. [Zaina], please.

[ZAINA]:

Manal, today I just want to say thank you. Thank you for your patience. Thank you for your efforts. Thank you for all the goodwill you've given to our committee. And personally, thank you for all the support. And thank you for the guidance you provided me as a GAC newcomer. Actually, today I have mixed feelings. Although I'm happy for you, for your relief, but I'm also a little bit sad because I'm going to miss your inspirational and your wise leadership. Sorry, Nico, no offense. But at the same time, I'm worried because you've set the bar very high, not only for Nico, but also for all the women and for all the Arab colleagues in the GAC. I'm confident that you'll experience tons of success in whatever mission you'll start after GAC leadership. Thank you for everything, Manal.

ROBERT HOGGARTH:

Thank you, [Zaina]. Gabriella, you're next.

GABRIELLA:

Thank you. I know we are many in this room, but I wanted to take this opportunity to express on behalf of my country and myself that we are thankful for all your support, leadership in all these years, in enormously contributing to the consensus within the GAC. I wanted to say muchas gracias, shukran inter, and also want to share my time with someone who wants to talk too.

spr2

Manal, the best chair that GAC could have and the best person I know in this environment. And as you have told me several times, we share this ICANN addiction for many years. So I hope to see you around in the next

meetings, and I wish you the best in everything that you do. You know how much I like you. And Nico, the best of luck. We are on your side.

ROBERT HOGGARTH: Thank you very much. Susan, you're next on the floor.

SUSAN CHALMERS: The United States extends its deepest thanks and gratitude to you, Manal, our outgoing chair, whose steady leadership tempered with grace, kindness, and endless patience is a model for us all. Thank you.

ROBERT HOGGARTH: Thank you, Susan. Suada, you're next.

SUADA HADZOVIC: Thank you, Manal, for being a wonderful and inspiring person and for being a great GAC chair. The biggest impression on me when I first met Manal was her gentle smile. After that, new positive impressions followed. The patience to listen, the kindness, the fairness, the respect she shows to others, the expertise and skills to solve even difficult situations fairly in her elegant way. All these qualities make Manal an excellent leader, as she demonstrated as GAC chair. Working with Manal is an honor and a pleasure. In my capacity as a co-chair of Human Rights Working Group, I would like to thank you, Manal, for all your advices, for your patience, for your time, and all your support you give to our work. I wish you all the best as you deserve this. Thank you.

ROBERT HOGGARTH: Thank you, Suada.

MANAL ISMAIL: Rob, I think we should have started by the picture.

ROBERT HOGGARTH: Ian, can you take the mic? Thanks.

IAN SHELDON: Thanks, Rob. Manal, on behalf of the Australian Government, we would like to extend our sincere thanks for your leadership of the GAC. Your leadership style brought a calm, even hand to the operation of the GAC, and your leadership in particular, through the challenges of COVID, have very much exemplified this. You have made an incredible contribution to the GAC and the whole ICANN community.

On a personal note, the ICANN cohort is an incredibly formidable one to wrangle and manage. You have set an incredibly high bar for the years to come. Good luck, Nico. I wish you all the best in your future endeavors. I hope our paths cross again in the future. Thank you.

ROBERT HOGGARTH: Thank you, Ian. Feng, before you start, if I can alert Jason, Shelley-Ann, Rudy, Par, and Tracy. You're up in the queues next. Feng, please go ahead.

GUO FENG: Dear Manal, on behalf of the Chinese Government, and also in my own capacity, I would like to extend our wholehearted thanks to you for your

excellent work conducted as GAC Chair. It was an amazing experience for me to work with you in the GAC leadership team, as well as the ATRT 1 and 2. Thank you once again for your tremendous contribution and commitment to this committee and global Internet governance. We wish you all the best in your future life and career. Thank you very much.

ROBERT HOGGARTH: Thank you, Feng. Jason, the floor is yours.

JASON MERRITT: Thank you so much. Boy, when you're number 22 on the list and you hear all these beautiful words, it's hard to articulate things at this point. You know, there's a lot of ways to express gratitude to somebody, and as I was thinking about this, I was trying to find a sort of unique or creative way to do that. For everything that you've done, for current GAC members, every GAC member that's passed through here under your tenure, and speaking personally, having the pleasure to have worked with you closely on some matters, and you've been nothing but graceful, patient, and kind the whole time. As somebody who's relatively new to this space, it's a tremendous amount of appreciation for that. So just to be very simple and sincere, it's the Government of Canada's privilege to just say thank you to you.

ROBERT HOGGARTH: Thank you, Jason. Shelley-Ann, I'll turn the floor over to you and Karen.

KAREL DOUGLAS: Thank you, Rob. Before I get to the prepared text, I just wanted to say, you know, I joined the GAC in 2017, and shortly thereafter, Manal joined—she became the chair, and so I've known Manal, or only known Manal, so it's very emotional for me to thank her for all the opportunities. Manal, Trinidad and Tobago, Shelley-Ann, and myself wholeheartedly thank you for the unswerving commitment, quiet strength, and sound expertise that you characterized your chairmanship of the GAC. You always made it look so easy. No simple task when coordinating a group as diverse as this one, with its multiplicity of interests, views, and personalities.

SHELLEY-ANN CLARKE-HINDS: In this month of celebrating women, we celebrate you for having paved a path for many others to follow. We also thank the Government of Egypt and your family for the privilege they have afforded the GAC and the wider ICANN community in gifting you to us [inaudible] and all the best.

ROBERT HOGGARTH: Thank you, Shelley-Ann and Karel. Rudy, you have the floor.

RUDY NOLDE: Thank you. I have the pleasure to express our thanks, not only on behalf of the German Government, but also on behalf of the European Commission, since our colleague Esteve Sanz is already at the airport. Dear Manal, I've joined the GAC in August 2020, when you were already, I think, more than half through your time as GAC chair. And while a lot has changed, you were always a constant figure, leading us smoothly

through our GAC sessions. And throughout your terms, you have fulfilled the role as GAC chair with professionalism, steadiness, and not to forget, kindness. And I hope that you will remain involved in the GAC in some shape or form in the future. We are extremely thankful for your service to the GAC, and I would also like to welcome Nico as the incoming GAC chair. We really appreciate your willingness to take on this important task, and we are very much looking forward to working with you in the future. Thank you very much.

ROBERT HOGGARTH: Thank you, Rudy. Par, you're next.

PAR BRUMARK: Dear Manal, I've had the privilege to act as vice chair during your leadership for four terms. And I have really this honest, I've never in my life worked with anyone with anyone having such senseful kindness, fairness, calm, patience, integrity, exceptional work capacity and ethics. So Manal, you embody great leadership by being who you are, an amazing person. So thank you. You taught me a lot.

ROBERT HOGGARTH: Thank you. Tracy, before you start, I'll alert the next group. Brian, Guy Roland, Wen-Fong, and Christine.

TRACY HACKSHAW: I'm going to drop some history here. I remember in 2009, went along with several other powerful leaders like Mary Uduma, Alice Munyua, and Heather Dryden, Manal, as then GAC vice chair, was one of the very

first persons to warmly welcome me into the then-closed GAC meetings as an ICANN fellow. I met Manal again that year while visiting her home country as an ISOC IGF ambassador at the 2009 IGF in Shamal Sheikh, Egypt, where you could clearly see and sense the deep respect, pride, and admiration that the colleagues at home have for her.

I recall our work together on restructuring the GAC communique that you see here today, the format, the GAC scorecard, the online advisory register, and many may not be aware that Manal was perhaps the singular force behind what is now known as the BGIG and the key catalyst in improving and enhancing ICANN board and GAC relations in the pre-IANA transition era.

As you can see, I have literally grown up in the ICANN IG world over the last 15 years, and you've always been there, steady, solid, and reliable in the face of everything. You have had a very real and true impact on my career and my life. I want to take this opportunity to let you know that your always gracious and compassionate support, advice, and guidance over the year, as I joined the GAC leadership team and on various working groups, was very much appreciated.

You have done so much, so quietly, so professionally, and so comprehensively, and with absolutely no fanfare, that I believe you are worthy of the very highest commendation. Let us recognize and salute the sterling efforts of Manal in the GAC and ICANN and global Internet governance leadership. Manal, wherever you go next and whatever you do, I am certain that you will excel just as you have here in the GAC, and I wish you and your family good health and every success onwards and upwards. Thank you.

ROBERT HOGGARTH: Thank you, Tracy. On to you, Brian.

BRIAN BECKHAM: Manal, I speak not only for the Secretariat of WIPO, but indeed for many IGOs who owe you a great thanks, and also for myself. Manal, [inaudible] on a job well done, we are truly indebted for your thoughtful service and [inaudible] for your steadfast patience, for your tireless dedication, and for your capable guidance. Thank you.

ROBERT HOGGARTH: Thank you, Brian. Guy Roland.

GUY ROLAND NTSIMBA: Manal, the Republic of Congo wants to thank you for your professionalism and for your availability as a GAC chair. You certainly were a person that reached a consensus of all people here, so we thank you and respect you for your leadership, for your work, for your efforts, for everything that we have done together. So, I hope you have a very fruitful future in your career. Thank you very much.

[WEN-FONG TSEN:] Thank you, Manal. I'd like to express my appreciation for your incomparable leadership and guidance. It's been an honor to having you as a GAC chair, managing, organizing, and motivating GAC on many occasions and topics. You have orchestrated the GAC in a manner that allows voices of everyone to be heard. You also value every different

opinion so that our discussions and issues are able to be prompted and constructive. It's been great working with you and wish you all the best as you move on to your next adventure. Thank you again.

ROBERT HOGGARTH:

Thank you. Our last two speakers asked to be in this order, and so I'll turn the floor over to Christine first. Thanks.

CHRISTINE ARIDA:

So, Manal in Arabic means a gift or an attainment or an achievement. So, I think it's a person that is exactly the name she holds, and I recall the journey since the very early days of the ICANN and GAC meetings over 20 years ago, and the long road that both GAC and ICANN have come through. I think, Manal, you've been instrumental in that. You've been there for the most important milestones, and I recall just the IDN introduction, the IANA transition, and the hosting of two ICANN meetings in Egypt.

Your skills, whether on a professional level or your personality, are a [both commendable,] and I stand there as a witness for over many, many years of being your colleague, I've learned a lot from you. But in the GAC, you've demonstrated how you have skillful chairmanship skills, how you can be flexible to build consensus at the same time, be focused, and move things forward as a great leader. Your dedication, your commitment, and your hard work is something that I can speak a lot to because I've seen the long, long hours that you've been giving to GAC and to the Board and to ICANN. Not everyone can do that. Personally, I'm not sure I can do the same. So, you motivate others

around you, but most importantly, on a very personal level, you never say no. You're always kind and welcoming, patient and tolerant, and with good humor.

So, on behalf of all colleagues in the Egyptian government, you have made us all proud with this chairmanship, and I'm happy to say that I've asked Manal to resume her role as the main GAC representative for Egypt. So, to everyone here, she'll be a colleague since the next round. Again, because her invaluable work, I think, is very important for GAC and for Egypt. And with that, I would like to tell you, Nico, that Egypt wishes you all the best in your term as a chair and all the success. Thank you.

ROBERT HOGGARTH:

Thank you, Christine. And for the final word, the next incoming GAC chair, Nico.

NICOLAS CABALLERO:

Thank you, and I'll try to be brief. You know, after everything that was said, it's kind of difficult to say anything else, but I'll do my best. And I did prepare something here for Manal. Good afternoon to all my distinguished GAC colleagues present here and online. Today, we all have gathered to bid farewell to one of our best colleagues and GAC chair for the last five years, Manal Ismail.

It is so difficult to let go of a wonderful person who has done so much for the GAC, and Manal is that person. She has filled this place with joy, patience, and wisdom through her presence. Manal has worked for this organization for more than five years. Actually, I would say 15 or 20

years. And throughout all those years, she has never let the GAC or ICANN down. She is widely known for her professional behavior and hard work. And by the way, I am sure, Manal, you have set a benchmark for all other colleagues present here today, certainly for me.

Whatever the task was, Manal did it effortlessly. You are always creative when it comes to ideas and how to execute them, and because of that, all GAC projects which were under your guidance have been successful. And I really hope people have learned from you, as I, myself, have tried to do so far.

You are a mentor and inspiration to many colleagues from all over the world, coming from different cultures and speaking totally different languages. I remember when a new batch of ICANN fellows arrived in the good old days of ICANN more than eight years ago. Manal took it as her responsibility to train them for the next two ICANN meetings.

The way you have contributed to this organization cannot be put into words. We will surely miss you as you got your job done without any kind of delay. Although it makes everybody at the GAC and ICANN sad to see you leave, the cherishable moments and memories of working with you will always remain with each and every one of us.

So, with a heavy heart, and a heavy and grateful heart, I wish you good luck with your position back in Egypt. May you find again your workplace at NTRA pleasant and reach greater heights, enjoying at the same time the company of your loved ones. As the incoming GAC chair, and on behalf of everyone, I wish you the best of luck with your activities back home. And finally, I just want to say thank you for your stay at the

GAC. It's been a privilege working with you. Now I turn the floor back to you for adjourning the meeting.

MANAL ISMAIL:

I can't thank you all enough. I'm emotionally drained and it has been a pleasure working with every one of you, and I wouldn't have made it without the support of everyone. So, starting with the amazing GAC support team working tirelessly, Rob, Fabien, Benedetta, Julia and Gulden, I feel like I'm working with a team of 10, serving us 24 by 7 in all time zones, very professionally, always having my back. Thank you very much.

And the GAC leadership, of course, all vice chairs filling in for me when I was not feeling well. Thank you. Thank you very much. And topic leads and GAC liaisons, working group leads and co-chairs, everyone was very helpful. And again, without the help of everyone, nothing would have been achieved. And IT colleagues at the back and interpreters and scribes, even from remote—and apologies, I've been ruining everyone's life today. We're always exceeding time. Thank you for staying that late. And even colleagues back home, if they were not supporting and filling in for me, this wouldn't have been the case.

So, yeah, I'll stop here, because I started to compete with Nico on the tissues as well. So, please be so kind, as kind as you have been to me, be so kind to Nico. I'm sure he's going to do an even better job. And Nico, I remain available if you need anything, and I'll stay around, I hope. Thank you. Thanks.

I almost forgot to adjourn the meeting, so thank you, everyone.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]